# Sampling Distribution of $\bar{X}$ and Simulation Methods 

Lecture 11

Reading: Sections 10.3-10.5

## Ontario Public Sector Salaries

- Public Sector Salary Disclosure Act, 1996
- Requires organizations that receive public funding from the Province of Ontario to disclose annually the names, positions, salaries and total taxable benefits of employees paid $\$ 100,000$ or more in a calendar year
- E.g. Government of Ontario, Crown Agencies, Municipalities, Hospitals, Boards of Public Health, School Boards, Universities, Colleges, Hydro One, Ontario Power Generation, etc.

2013 disclosure of 2012 salaries: https://www.ontario.ca/page/public-sector-salary-disclosure-act-disclosures-2013

## Sampling Error a Plausible Explanation for $\bar{X}$ being $\$ 3,700$ above $\mu$ ?

- For all ON public sector employees w/ salaries of $\$ 100 \mathrm{~K}+$, mean is $\$ 127.5 \mathrm{~K}$ and s.d. $\$ 39.6 \mathrm{~K}$
- Are these numbers parameters or statistics?
- Shape of the salary distribution? (2 explanations)
- Random sample of 1,000 Ontario public sector employees has a mean salary of $\$ 131.2 \mathrm{~K}$
- Why is $\bar{X}$ different than $\mu$ ?
- How likely is such a big sample mean if claim true? i.e. $P(\bar{X} \geq 131.2 \mid \mu=127.5, \sigma=39.6, n=1,000)=$ ?



## STATA Summary of Population

|  | Percentiles | Smallest |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1\% | 100.168 | 100 |  |  |
| 5\% | 100.9921 | 100 |  |  |
| 10\% | 102.0471 | 100 | Obs | 88545 |
| 25\% | 105.7447 | 100 | Sum of Wgt. | 88545 |
| 50\% | 115.3013 |  | Mean | 127.5176 |
|  |  | Largest | Std. Dev. | 39.64454 |
| 75\% | 133.2821 | 843.095 |  |  |
| 90\% | 164.5416 | 935.2365 | Variance | 1571.69 |
| 95\% | 193.125 | 1036.74 | Skewness | 5.019101 |
| 99\% | 296.8753 | 1720 | Kurtosis | 64.99817 |

Note: Technically, $\sigma=39.6443$. STATA computes $s$, not $\sigma$ : but degrees of freedom correction matters little given large number of observations.

## Mean and Variance of $\bar{X}$

- $\mu_{\bar{X}}=E[\bar{X}]=E\left[\frac{\sum_{i=1}^{n} X_{i}}{n}\right]=\frac{1}{n} \sum_{i=1}^{n} E\left[X_{i}\right]=$ $\frac{1}{n} \sum_{i=1}^{n} \mu=\frac{1}{n} n \mu=\mu$
- $\sigma_{\bar{X}}^{2}=V[\bar{X}]=V\left[\frac{\sum_{i=1}^{n} X_{i}}{n}\right]=\frac{1}{n^{2}} \sum_{i=1}^{n} V\left[X_{i}\right]=$ $\frac{1}{n^{2}} \sum_{i=1}^{n} \sigma^{2}=\frac{1}{n^{2}} n \sigma^{2}=\frac{\sigma^{2}}{n}$
- $\sigma_{\bar{X}}=\frac{\sigma}{\sqrt{n}} \quad$ So, $\mu_{\bar{X}}=\mu$ and $\sigma_{\bar{X}}=\frac{\sigma}{\sqrt{n}}$, but what's the shape of the sampling distribution of $\bar{X}$ ?
But first, in deriving $\sigma_{\bar{X}}$ above, why is $V\left[\sum_{i=1}^{n} X_{i}\right]=\sum_{i=1}^{n} V\left[X_{i}\right]$ ? ${ }_{6}$


## 10\% Condition / 10\% Rule

- Derivation of $\sigma_{\bar{X}}^{2}$ assumes that each observation ( $X_{i}$ ) is independent of others
- For this to be true, must sample with replacement OR sample without replacement from a population that is infinitely large
- In contrast, real applications involve sampling without replacement from a finite population
- BUT if sample < 10\% of population, assumption is true enough: can use theoretical results


## Recall Parking Permit Ex (Lec. 10)



Sample Mean (X-bar)

$$
\begin{aligned}
& E[\bar{X}]=\mu=0.8=0 * 0.064+\frac{1}{3} * 0.192 \\
& +\frac{2}{3} * 0.288+1 * 0.256+\frac{4}{3} * 0.144+\frac{5}{3} \\
& * 0.048+2 * 0.008 \\
& V[\bar{X}]=\frac{\sigma^{2}}{n}=\frac{0.56}{3}=0.187 \\
& =(0-0.8)^{2} 0.064+\left(\frac{1}{3}-0.8\right)^{2} 0.192
\end{aligned}
$$

$$
+\left(\frac{2}{3}-0.8\right)^{2} 0.288+(1-0.8)^{2} 0.256
$$

$$
+\left(\frac{4}{3}-0.8\right)^{2} 0.144+\left(\frac{5}{3}-0.8\right)^{2} 0.048
$$

$$
+(2-0.8)^{2} 0.008
$$

Work to find $\mu_{\bar{X}}$ and $\sigma_{\bar{X}}^{2}$ not
needed. Why is work needed?

## Shape of sampling distribution of $\bar{X}$ ?

- Central Limit Theorem (CLT): For a random sample from any population the sampling distribution of the sample mean $(\bar{X})$ is approximately Normal for a sufficiently large sample size
- Rough rule of thumb: sample size $\geq 30$
- < 30 sufficient for modestly non-Normal populations
- If population is Normal, then $\mathrm{n} \geq 1$ ok
- > 30 necessary for extreme departures



Is sampling error a plausible explanation for $\bar{X}$ as big as 131.2? ${ }_{11}$

## Sampling Error: Plausible Explanation?

$$
\begin{aligned}
& P(\bar{X} \geq 131.2 \mid \mu=127.518, \sigma=39.645, n=1,000) \\
& =P\left(\frac{\bar{X}-\mu_{\bar{X}}}{\sigma_{\bar{X}}} \geq \frac{131.2-\mu_{\bar{X}}}{\sigma_{\bar{X}}}\right) \quad \begin{array}{l}
\text { What if sample size } 50 ? \\
P(\bar{X} \geq 131.2 \mid \mu=127.5 \\
\sigma=39.6, n=50)=? \\
=P\left(Z \geq \frac{131.2-127.518}{39.645 / \sqrt{1,000})} \begin{array}{l}
\text { What serious problem may we } \\
\text { Wace in trying to find this } \\
\text { probability? }
\end{array}\right. \\
=P\left(Z \geq \frac{3.682}{1.254}\right)
\end{array} \\
& =P(Z \geq 2.94)=0.0016
\end{aligned}
$$



## Monte Carlo Simulation

- Monte Carlo Simulation: A problem solving method where a computer generates many random samples and you make an inference based on patterns in outcomes
- Simulation is most useful when theoretical results (e.g. CLT) do not apply and the problem is too big for an analytic approach
- It allows us to find sampling distributions with a high degree of accuracy


## Recall Central Limit Theorem

- The CLT says the sampling distribution of the sample mean is Bell shaped no matter what the shape of the population so long as the sample size is sufficiently large
- What is sufficiently large?
- Is a "rule of thumb" always correct or is it just a rough guide?
- What factors affect how large is sufficiently large?


## $\mathrm{n}=50$ : Sufficiently Large?

- Monte Carlo simulation: many samples of 50

ON public employees (in each sample, $n=50$ )

- \# simulation draws (\# samples drawn) = very big
- Simulation error: Chance difference between simulated probability and true probability
- Drive it to zero by doing many draws
- For each sample compute the sample mean
- Summarize distribution of $\bar{X}$ : graphically
(histogram) and numerically (Stata summary)

Simulated Sampling Distribution of $\bar{X}$ for $n=50$


|  | Percentiles | Smallest |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1\% | 116.9729 | 109.5587 |  |  |
| 5\% | 119.4248 | 109.6845 |  |  |
| 10\% | 120.8754 | 111.0465 | Obs | 500000 |
| 25\% | 123.5441 | 111.2133 | Sum of Wgt. | 500000 |
| 50\% | 126.9508 |  | Mean | 127.513 |
|  |  | Largest | Std. Dev. | 5.600294 |
| 75\% | 130.8465 | 172.6622 |  |  |
| 90\% | 134.8423 | 173.6038 | Variance | 31.3633 |
| 95\% | 137.4918 | 174.159 | Skewness | . 6994546 |
| 99\% | 143.1469 | 174.9272 | Kurtosis | 4.167933 |

[^0]
## Three Very Different Histograms



Summary of a Random Sample
salary

|  | Percentiles | Smallest |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1\% | 100.1664 | 100.1664 |  |  |
| 5\% | 100.9522 | 100.9473 |  |  |
| 10\% | 102.0943 | 100.9522 | Obs | 50 |
| 25\% | 108.7771 | 101.021 | Sum of Wgt. | 50 |
| 50\% | 121.4592 |  | Mean | 132.7467 |
|  |  | Largest | Std. Dev. | 34.22585 |
| 75\% | 155 | 173.4973 |  |  |
| 90\% | 167.9037 | 183.4379 | Variance | 1171.409 |
| 95\% | 183.4379 | 219.4789 | Skewness | 2.125154 |
| 99\% | 283.6693 | 283.6693 | Kurtosis | 9.144829 |

## Simulated Sampling Distribution of the Sample Median for $n=50$



## Summary of Simulated Sampling Dist. of Sample Median for $n=50$ <br> Median

|  | Percentiles | Smallest |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1\% | 108.8332 | 104.4422 |  |  |
| 5\% | 110.5338 | 104.7897 |  |  |
| 10\% | 111.4963 | 104.8258 | Obs | 500000 |
| 25\% | 113.2028 | 104.97 | Sum of Wgt. | 500000 |
| 50\% | 115.2876 |  | Mean | 115.4981 |
|  |  | Largest | Std. Dev. | 3.265556 |
| 75\% | 117.5475 | 135.461 |  |  |
| 90\% | 119.9086 | 137.6988 | Variance | 10.66386 |
| 95\% | 121.0002 | 138.1573 | Skewness | . 4225524 |
| 99\% | 124.086 | 139.0575 | Kurtosis | 3.392273 |

How to interpret 113.2028? How to interpret 135.461?


[^0]:    Is the simulation giving the correct mean and Std. Dev.?

